The Representation and Presentation of 'Visible Minority' MPPs in the Legislative Assembly of Ontario

by

Jason Lagerquist
Intern, 2006-2007
Ontario Legislature Internship Programme (OLIP)
Room 1303, Whitney Block,
99 Wellesley Street West,
Queen's Park,
Toronto, Ontario
M7A 1A2

(o) 416.325.0040 (h) 416.484.9357

jason.lagerquist@yahoo.com

Paper delivered at the Annual Meeting of Canadian Political Science Association, 9 a.m., Friday, June 1, 2007, Saskatoon, Saskachewan

Introduction

The notion that Canada represents a 'cultural mosaic' has increasingly become a prominent tool used when constructing most conceptions of Canadian national identity. The belief that immigrants can arrive in Canada and preserve the distinctive cultural traits that were developed in their country of birth, while simultaneously inheriting a new, culturally diverse Canadian identity has become a source of pride for many Canadians. The development of a culturally sensitive, socio-political landscape has even become a form of ammunition for Canadian nationalists, many of whom will promote the Canadian 'cultural mosaic' as a more virtuous and fruitful type of society than the assimilation-centered, 'melting pot' that is believed to be in existence in the United States. As we celebrate ethnic and cultural diversity as positive steps towards the formation of a national identity, it begs the question; do our democratic institutions appropriately reflect this diversity? Does the deep-rooted tradition of British parliamentarianism present any challenges to newcomers who might not share this tradition?

This paper will focus on the representation and participation of visible minority Members of Provincial Parliament (MPP) in the Legislative Assembly of Ontario. Are visible minority MPPs appropriately represented in the Legislature? How does their experience differ from non-minority Members of the Legislature? Do they bring a distinct perspective to Legislative Process? What unique challenges do they face? What impact does the presence of visible minority MPPs have on the development and passage of legislation? What other practical benefits come from having visible minority MPPs present in both the legislature and the cabinet table? The contention that will be developed in the following analysis is that the experience of visible minority MPPs in Ontario does not differ substantially from non-minority Members. While some Members do feel additional pressure to represent their ethnic community at Queen's Park, the majority of their emphasis is on representing the interests of all Ontarians. Some underlying challenges are presented to minority Members, but overall there are no major factors in existence that hinder their political success in any dramatic way.

Conceptualization

Before proceeding with a more empirically-based study of the Ontario Legislature, it seems appropriate to first delineate what is meant by the term 'visible minority,' as hard and fast definitions of terms such as 'minorities' or 'minority groups' have become increasingly difficult to ascertain.

Mark Teney suggests that a definitive distinction needs to be made between the word "ethnic" and "race." The word ethnic is derived from the Greek *ethnikos*, the adjectival form of *ethos*, meaning nation or race. The word was originally used to identify someone who *was not* Christian or Jewish. The term race, however, caries with it a biological connotation as it places emphasis on characteristics of the body that are typically used when one is seeking an all-encompassing type of group identity. Teney

¹ Mark Teney. *Concepts of Ethnicity* cited in John Anner, ed. "Beyond Identity Politics: Emerging Social Justice Movements in Communities of Color." Boston: 1996, 2.

points out that "in its current usage a biological connotation sometimes adheres still to 'ethnic,' but...some groupings are defined by their genetic heritage, others by their language or religion or some other criterion.²

The concept of race, then, is what this paper is focused upon. Quite simply, I will be using the term 'visible minority' in reference someone who is not of the majority race in a given population. Because of existing population demographics in both Canada and the province of Ontario, visible minorities can be defined as persons who are non-Caucasian in race or non-white in colour. Therefore, when referring to visible minority MPPs I am in fact referring to those who are non-Caucasian. Spatial limitations are the primary rationale behind narrowing the focus of this paper to concentrate exclusively on non-caucasian MPPs. The experience of Caucasian MPPs born outside of Canada in countries such as Italy and Greece would be an interesting and fruitful avenue of exploration, as would the experience of gay and lesbian MPPs. Unfortunately, concerns will this study to the parameters outlined above.

Visible Minority MPPs in Ontario – An Overview

The symbolic importance of Ontario's Legislature – Queen's Park – cannot be understated. It has been said that the Legislature "stands as the embodiment of the province's democratic values – the people's representatives making laws in accordance with democratically expressed public opinion." If the notion that the Legislative Assembly symbolizes democracy in Ontario is true, one would like to assume that representation inside of the institution would adequately mirror the province's cultural landscape to best represent the public opinion of all Ontarians. While representation of visible minority MPPs in Ontario remains far below levels that can be seen as reflective of larger population demographics, slowly the face of politics is changing to better reflect the cultural landscape existing throughout the province.

A total of eight visible minority MPPs currently sit in the 103-seat Ontario Legislature, three of which have been appointed by Premier Dalton McGuinty to cabinet. Clearly, these numbers suggest that visible minorities are dramatically underrepresented politically, particularly when once considers that 19.1% ⁴ of Ontario's population can be considered a visible minority. While this under-representation is incredibly pronounced, it should be noted that the current total of eight visible minority MPPs actually represents a marked improvement over any other administration in Ontario's history.

Prior to the last provincial election in 2003, Liberal Member Alvin Curling and Progressive Conservatives David Tsubouchi and Raminder Gill where the only three visible minority MPPs in the 130 ⁵ seat Legislature, and Tsubouchi was the only visible

_

² Ibid, 5.

³ Graham White. *The Legislature: Central Symbol of Ontario Democracy* cited in Graham White, ed. "The Government and Politics of Ontario." Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997: 71.

⁴ This number is based upon the 1999 census conducted by Statistics Canada.

⁵ The number of available seats in the Ontario Legislature was reduced to 103 from 130 in 1995 as part of a re-organization of provincial election boundaries in order to see that they mirror Canadian federal election boundaries in Ontario.

minority cabinet minister. Gill was returned to the Legislature in 1999, meaning that Curling and Tsubouchi were the only two visible minority MPPs from 1995 thought to 1999. And while former New Democratic Premier Bob Rae is often credited for increasing the presence of women in Ontario's Legislature, he was far less successful at providing a similar increase for visible minority MPPs. During Rae's term in office, only two visible minorities, Curling and Zanana Akande of the NDP, were active at Queen's Park. Interesting, Curling and Akande share a similar distinction, as the former was the first black Canadian to hold a cabinet position in Ontario, while the latter was the first black woman to do so when she was chosen by Rae to be Minister of Community and Social Services.

TABLE 1
Visible Minority Representation in Ontario's Legislature since 1990

Year	Governing Party	Number of Visible Minority MPPs	Number of Visible Minority Cabinet Ministers
1990	NDP	1	1
1995	Progressive Conservative	2	1
1999	Progressive Conservative	3	1
2003	Liberal	8	3

Ethnic Diversification in Ontario's Legislature

Perhaps surprisingly, there appears only to be a casual acknowledgment among MPPs at Queen's Park that representation needs to be diversified. While everyone agrees the diversification is important, there does not seem to be a serious sense of urgency felt most interviewed for this study. In other words, most Members recognize that diversification would be beneficial, but not necessarily essential. Ontario's Minister of Revenue, Michael Chan, who was born in Hong Kong and is the only Chinese-Canadian MPP active at the legislature, acknowledges that while he would prefer for the Chinese community to be better represented at the Legislature, it should not be overly emphasized. "For the Chinese community, a better percentage would be good because [there are] over 800,000 'Chinese origin' Canadians in the province of Ontario, but at the same time we have a sense that we're *all* Ontarians, we're *all* Canadians," suggests Chan. "To bring up a better percentage [of visible minority MPPs] I think would be good, in view of population demographics, but we should not be overly focused on this. It really should be more about the quality of the person, and how this person can serve to public and all Ontarians, not only one community."

Similarly, Ontario's Minister of Children and Youth Services, Mary Anne Chambers, believes that diversification is important, it should not be limited to ethnic or racial diversification. "I think that it's very important that efforts be made to all communities, and to have them feel as thought they have a voice at the table," explains

Chambers, was born in Jamaica. "Diversity comes in all shapes and sizes; gender, culture, ability, physical ability; we're not there in any of those cases."

Khalil Ramal, the Parliamentary Assistant to the Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, espouses a similar view to that of Minister Chan, that while increased diversification would be advantageous in some ways, we need not place a great emphasis on it. "I don't like the notion that there should be a certain number [of MPPs] from a certain community. Members should represent all of their constituents, regardless of their background, colour or nationalities. For me, I care about the person, not the background of the person or the ethnicity of the person." This seems to the view of most MPPs at Queen's Park, while diversification would be welcomed, it should not be overly emphasized.

While those working within the institution itself acknowledge only a limited desire for increased diversification in Ontario's Legislature, some working outside the institution put forth a stronger opinion that visible minorities require a stronger presence inside of the Legislature. "It's just too white in there," suggests Robert Benzie, a member of the Queen's Park press gallery for seven years. "We've never had a Native MPP...if this is to be a real democratic institution, we need to have representation that is not all upper-middle class lawyers from Toronto."

While opinions regarding the degree of urgency for which diversification inside the legislature is needed, the perception that the Legislature is slowly becoming more diverse – and will continue to do so – is seemingly unanimous. The reason for this, suggests University of Toronto sociology professor Edward Harvey, is that "the majority of visible minorities in Canada come from immigrant backgrounds. These immigrants and their families are too busy getting established and putting a roof over their heads to get involved in politics." Christina Blizzard, who has covered provincial politics in Ontario for the Toronto Sun since 1994, conquers with the notion that there is a natural delay between the time a family of immigrants first arrives, and the time when they enter politics. "First generation immigrants are just trying to get established in the country," she suggests, "it is either their children that will enter politics, or themselves at a later stage in their lives."

A quick examination of the biographies of each visible minority MPP in Ontario would seem to confirm the hypothesis that immigrants generally tend to establish themselves in the province *before* entering politics. Chambers spent 26 years in banking after immigrating to Canada from Jamaica. She entered politics after retiring from Scotiabank as a vice president. Similarly, Minister Chan owned his own insurance brokerage company, while Dr. Kuldip Kular and Dr. Shafiq Qaadri were both practicing medical professionals before their election to the Legislature. If we accept the hypothesis that the political representation of visible minorities will increase as minority communities continue to establish themselves throughout the province, it is reasonable to

_

⁶ Edward Harvey, cited in Joel Baglole. "Slowly, the face of politics changes; Visible minorities are growing rapidly but representatives aren't." The Toronto Star May 17, 1999: 1.

expect to see a continued diversification inside the Legislature, likely as soon the next election in 2007.

Another important consideration relating to representation of visible minority MPPs in Ontario is the importance that each party places on recruiting capable, high-profile candidates in each election. The numbers clearly indicate that the governing Liberal Party was the most successful at accomplishing this during the 2003 election campaign, as 8 of the 9 visible minority candidates that ran for the party were returned to the Legislature.

The New Democrate's were far less successful despite being the only Party in Ontario that has adopted an official affirmative-action policy with regards candidate recruitment. For the 2003 election campaign, 56% of the candidates that ran for the NDP were visible minorities, women, disabled, lesbian or gay. Their relative lack of success in 2003 had less to do with their effort or the quality of their candidates and more to do with the failure of their Party in general, suggests Blizzard. "There are so few of them in the first place, it wasn't even until recently that they reached official party status. Their lack of diversity has more to do with their Party's failure in the 2003 election than anything else."

The Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario are interesting in that of the 26 MPPs that currently sit in the Legislature, non are visible minority. Part of this can be explained by identifying the Party's traditional areas of support, namely rural constituencies, where visible minorities and immigrants are far less concentrated than in constituencies in and around the Toronto area. "It is much more challenging for a person who is new to a country, particularly one who is visibly new to a country, to be elected in a constituency where there are not large numbers of people from a background other than the traditional English-French background," suggests Government House Leader Jim Bradley. "Where you will see it being reflected more [visible minority MPPs] is in areas where concentrations of people from other countries of the world, where there are visible minorities." Because those new to Ontario tend to settle in urban constituencies relatively close to the city of Toronto, the Progressive Conservatives are placed at an inherent disadvantage because these areas are outside their traditional basis of support.

Another factor that helps to explain the current lack of ethnic diversity in the PC caucus is that, heading into the 2003 election, the majority of the PC candidates were long-standing incumbents who were first elected before the gradual increase in visible minority political participation began. "All of those guys [PC candidates in the 2003 election] were leftover from the Harris/Eves years," suggests Blizzard. "Many of them had been here for 10, 15 years, well before Queen's Park began to diversify." Based on this analysis, it seems reasonable to expect some degree of ethnic diversification in the

_

⁷ Theresa Boyle. "Minorities still rare in the Legislature: Indian-born Tory MPP sees little change in decades as Parties seek to increase ethnic representation." <u>The Toronto Star September 3, 2003</u>: A10. ⁸ The New Democratic Party of Ontario won only 7 seats in the 2003 election, depriving them of "official Party status." They reclaim party status in 2004 when Andrea Horwath was returned to the Legislature following a victory in a by-election.

PC caucus after the upcoming provincial election, particularly if leader John Tory expects to achieve the electoral success in the Toronto that he has promised.

In terms of representation, a general consensus seems to exist suggesting that increased diversity in Ontario's legislature would be beneficial, and that we appear to be experiencing a period of transition whereby diversity is naturally developing. "We have currently have more people who are visible minorities in the House than ever before," explains Bradley, who was first elected to the Legislature in 1977 and is the most experienced MPP at Queen's Park, although not a minority member. "This is still not a reflection of the true face of Ontario yet, but I think we'll see it in this generation, in fact, I think we'll see it in the next decade."

A Special Contribution? – What do Visible Minority MPPs bring to Queen's Park?

A definite unanimity existed among those interviewed for this study suggesting that Ontario's Legislature would benefit from having more visible minority MMPs at Queen's Park. And while it is generally accepted that diversification would enhance democratic legitimacy to the Legislature, other, more practical benefits were also identified.

One such benefit is the ability of MPPs from specific cultural communities to communicate with their respective community when legislation is passed that has a direct impact them. Not only does this makes specific communities feel as thought their views are being represented, but it also allows for the minority MPPs to explain to community members exactly how legislation will effect them. For example, because so many of Ontario's taxi drivers happen to be of East-Indian decent, members of Ontario's East-Indian community appreciated the role that political actors such as then Minister of Transportation, Harinder Takhar, played in crafting legislation that directly impacts this particular profession. "I don't only have represent my own constituents, which I do, but at the same time I have to represent other broader communities, who expect me to address some of their issues," explains Takhar.

To this end Minister Takhar put forth Bill 169 in 2005 which made it an offense for unlicensed taxi drivers to pick up passengers at Pearson International Airport. "95% of taxi drivers at the airport are East-Indian. They had some issues that had been [of a concern] for 25, 30 years, which were addressed. If [MPPs representing the East-Indian community] were not there, maybe those issues would still be [unresolved]." The presence of minority Members such as Takhar was greatly appreciated by many within the East-Indian community. "They liked that Takhar was there to advocate on their behalf," said Robert Benzie of the Toronto Star. "In this instance, the East-Indian community felt that their views were being represented."

Apart from their influence on the drafting of specific pieces of legislation, visible minority MPPs give the government an inherent advantage when embarking on international undertakings, particularly economic undertakings. Minority MPPs can help to facilitate international initiatives by providing an additional, first-hand understanding

of specific countries with which the government wishes to do business. Arnold Chan, Chief of Staff to Minister Michael Chan and former Executive Assistant to Premier McGuinty, suggests that minority MPPs can play an important role in international initiatives such as trade missions. "Ontario's economy is export based, but we don't compete on the basis of having the lowest labour costs or the most fluid capital, we complete based upon the diversity of our workforce and our ability to serve *anybody* in *any language*." Having government representatives that can reinforce this point is an inherent advantage.

A practical example of this advantage can be seen in Premier McGuinty's recent trade mission to India and Pakistan, during which Minister Takhar and other Members played a central role. "I know how India operates; much better than a person from [Ontario] going there to do business. I know the culture, I know the traditions, I know how business operates there. I know how long it will take to do business there, and I know how they will negotiate," says Takhar. The importance of this type of "insider knowledge" brought to the table by Takhar and others cannot be understated, particularly when one considers that trade between Ontario and India reached \$1-billion in 2005, marking an 80% increase in just five years. 9 "But at the same time I've been [in Ontario] for over 30 years I also know how business operates here and what kind of goods and services we have that we can sell in India. So you can see there is a kind of unique fit in a way, where we become an ambassador to open doors for Canadian companies in India." It would seem that the experience and knowledge brought by Minister Takhar was utilized effectively during this particular trade mission, as several deals were signed between representatives of each jurisdiction, and 40 memorandums of understanding were agreed to. It is difficult to characterize the presence of Minister Takhar as being anything other than advantageous to Premier McGuinty throughout his time in both India and Pakistan.

As suggested earlier, in some instances the life experiences of visible minority MPPs can be used as a tool by Party Leaders to help explain policies and party positions to the general public. Take for example the story of David Tsubouchi, who was Ontario's first Japanese-Canadian cabinet minister and the one of two visible minority MPPs in the Harris/Eves caucus during the Progressive Conservativ Party's eight years in power. Tsubouchi's mother was kept in a British Columbia internment camp during World War Two, while his father was kept in a prisoner of war camp. Restrictions placed upon Japanese-Canadians during this period meant that when the war finally ended, the Tsubouchi family had no money, no education and owned no property. Despite growing up in poverty, he was able to put himself through law school after which he became a highly successful lawyer in Ontario, before entering politics.¹⁰

Christian Blizzard suggests that Tsubouchi was appointed Minister of Social Services in 1995 because, in addition to being a incredibly capable individual, experiences throughout his life would allow for him to best explain to the public the large

-

⁹ Puja Uppal. "McGuinty hopes to improve ties to India: 21st-century strategy." <u>The National Post</u>. February 14, 2007: 15.

¹⁰ Joseph Simcoe. "Ex-cabinet minister has had a lifetime of overcoming." <u>Era-Banner</u> June 10, 2006: 1.

cuts to social welfare that Premier Harris planned to implement. "A big factor in David being given that position, at least I believe, is because of his upbringing. He had lived in poverty, he knew what it was like to economize; Mike Harris had to have felt that the cuts to social spending would be taken better if the came from someone like David," she says. While Tsubouchi's cabinet position was not given to him simply because he was Japanese, his life experiences, which *were* a direct result of his ethnicity, helped Harris reach the conclusion that [Tsubouchi] was right for the job. It is for these same reasons Blizzard feels that Tsubouchi was victimized by unfair criticism after he suggested that welfare recipients attempt to barter with store owners and attempt to get a deal on dented cans of tuna, which instigated rampant criticism from both opposition and from the media, claiming that the Minister was arrogant. "It wasn't that David was arrogant at all," explains Blizzard. "The reason he made those suggestions is because *he had* bought dented cans of tuna when his family was poor and in need of food. He had experienced what it was like to live on an incredibly fixed income."

One last advantage that comes from having increased diversity in Ontario's Legislature is that it projects an image to young people throughout the province that politics is naturally inclusive, and that they can become involved. "One advantage that comes with having diversity in any kind of setting is that other people can see it as a possibility," says Minister Chambers. "When you see some type of indication that there are possibilities...I think that it is very important that every effort be made to reach out and to engage people which will then manifest itself in physical presence if people feel welcome."

Unique Challenges?

Being that the Legislative process in Ontario clearly reflects its British Parliamentary heritage, it seems reasonable to investigate what challenges are faced by MPPs who might not be as familiar with such traditions. While it was never suggested that visible minority MPPs face any one challenge that dramatically impacted their ability to serve their constituents and advance within their own party, certain secondary issues were identified as potential concern for some visible minority MPPs.

The first of which is language. Because legislative proceedings are conducted in either English or French, MPPs who are not overly proficient in either language enter the legislature at a distinct disadvantage. This disadvantage, it should be noted, extends to all Members who do not speak English or French as their first language, not just those who are a visible minority. That said the point is certainly worth noting. "If you think about the great Parliamentarians throughout history, they are usually great orators," explains Christina Blizzard. "To a large extent, MPPs are judged by how they handle themselves in the House, and if someone comes in who is not overly proficient in English, they could have a problem."

¹¹ William Walker. "Minister 'tripped up,' Premier says tuna remark due to 'inexperience.' <u>Toronto Star</u> October 5, 1995: 26.

This disadvantage is most pronounced each day during the time allotted for oral questions, or Question Period. This time "serves as a critical part of the political jockeying and campaigning that occurs between elections. The media coverage that it generates...makes Question Period a crucial tool in molding the perceptions and voting intentions of the electorate." Because Question Period is such an important part of any legislative day, where the political stakes are arguably at their highest levels, it is easy to see why any Premier would have difficulty elevating any MPP to a ministerial position if they were not overly competent speakers of either English or French. "Question Period is tough enough on those who speak perfect English," says Blizzard. "Imagine having to be subjected to that grilling if you could not fully comprehend what you were being asked, or properly articulate you point?"

In addition to the language issue, other problems can arise that can be associated with cultural adoption. "At the start of each day there is a prayer from the Holly Bible that is followed by Christians," noted Minister Bradley, "while there is tolerance of and to some degree a celebration of cultural holidays and religious holidays, you can still assume that this is still a Christian Legislature which really it is not, but that's what the prayers [would indicate]."

The issue touched upon by Minister Bradley really deals with the general comfort level of minority MPPs. In other words, do minority MPPs who might not share similar cultural traditions experience any degree of discomfort? Based on interviews conducted for this paper, the general comfort level amongst the minority Members is quite high. Minister Chan acknowledged that while he did experience a mild degree of discomfort when first entering the Legislature because of the fact that he is the only Chinese Canadian MPP, he insists that these feelings were "self imposed" to large extent. "When I look around I don't see any other Chinese [MPPs] around, so there is some unintended pressure. This is what I feel, especially during my first week to walk into the House. But once [I] got into it, 'what the heck'? We're all people. We're all kind of together."

Apart from Minister Chan's mild feelings of discomfort during his first week at Queen's Park, no MPP interviewed for this paper indicated that they felt any substantive feelings of discomfort inside of the Legislature. However, Ontario's Minister Takhar did indicate that he felt some additional pressure to not only represent his constituents inside Queen's Park, but also the interests of Ontario's Indian community. Takhar describes himself as playing a "double duty," meaning that he performs duties within the Indian community that are in addition to those normally associated with an MPP. As a result, some minority MPPs do not only attend events within our own ridings, they are sometimes expected to attend cultural events outside of their ridings. "There's definitely some added pressure," admits Takhar. "Last summer I attended 19 weddings, because, there is a certain expectation within [the East Indian] community that I attend weddings. They also expect us to go to the funerals. They expect us to attend sports functions. They expect us to attend religious functions. There is an added dimention to the role [of MPP] that is sometimes bigger than your original role, but I have to do it."

-

¹² Christopher J. Schnarr. "Question Period Strategies in the Ontario Legislature." Cited in Graham White, Ontario Legislature Internship Essays Toronto: The Canadian Political Science Association, 1993: 96.

Conclusions

The aim of this paper was to investigate the roles of Members of Provincial Parliament in Ontario to discover what makes their experience different from that of non-minority Members. In terms of mere representation in the Legislature, a unanimous acknowledgment exists suggesting that more minority members will prove to be beneficial to the legislative process, and that as immigrant groups establish themselves throughout the province a natural increase can be expected.

In terms of the development of legislation and the promotion of policy, a strong belief exists suggesting that visible minority MPPs can benefit a government in two substantive ways. Initially, they can bring a different prospective to the table when legislation is being developed, which will yield well-rounded polices that are inherently more inclusive. Secondly, minority MPPs can serve as a communication tool that can help the government convey a particular message to a specific community when that community is affected. As Minister Chambers offers; "quite often it is easier for people who want to be heard to feel like they're being heard when the person that is listening seems to have an appreciation of their experiences." That said, it should also be made clear that minority MPPs do not see their role inside the Legislature as being limited to the point where their only duty is to advocate on behalf of their community. Dr. Kulip Kular summarized how he views his role at Queen's Park by stating that, "ever since I came to this country I [have never] felt like I am representing a particular minority group. I do feel that I am a representative of all the people in my riding that consists of all different types of ethnicities." This desire to work on behalf of all Ontarians – not just specific communities – was unanimously supported.

As the world becomes increasingly interconnected, the presence of visible minority MPPs will help Ontario in terms of its international and intergovernmental undertakings. It is in this area, suggests Minister Takhar, where you see "the biggest bang for your buck." As trade missions increase in economic importance, experience in and knowledge of different countries and different cultures can only be seem to be beneficial.

There does not appear to be any serious hindrances in effect that prevent visible minority MPPs from serving their constituents, performing inside the Legislature, or ascending inside of their party. Some Members suggested that they feel some additional pressure to represent the views of their particular community inside of the Legislature, but no substantive barriers were identified. Language and cultural adaptation were recognized as potential disadvantages, but these can be overcome with political experience.

In most ways the experience of visible minority MPPs differs only negligibly from that of non-minority Members. While some members described feeling some additional pressure in terms of representing their particular community at Queen's Park, those interviewed for this study seemed much more concerned with representing their own constituents, regardless of their ethnicity, in the Legislature.

Bibliography

- Anner, John. ed <u>Beyond Identity Politics: Emerging Social Justice Movements in Communities of Color</u> Boston, South End Press: 1996
- Baglole, Joel. "Slowly, the face of politics changes; Visible minorities are growing rapidly but representatives aren't" <u>The Toronto Star</u> May 17, 1999: 1.
- Boyle, Theresa. "Minorities still rare in Legislature; Indian-born Tory MPP sees little change in decades." The Toronto Star September 3, 2003: A10.
- Coyle, Jim. "Harris's new cabinet: White, right, slight" <u>Kingston Whig Standard</u> June 28, 1995: 7.
- Dowd, Eric. "Rae sets out to woo minorities with new rules for employers" The Windsor Star May 14, 1991: A7.
- Hall, Chris. "Ontario to promote women, minorities" <u>The Ottawa Citizen</u> January 23, 1991: A9.
- McGran, Kevin. "Angry cabbies tie up Queen's Park; Cabs circle and horns blare in drivers' protest Accuse minister of conflict of interest in airport limo war" The Toronto Star May 4, 2005: B7.
- Monsebraaten, Lauie. "Visible Minorities make inroads" <u>The Toronto Star</u> October 3, 2003: A10.
- Simcoe, Joseph. "Ex-cabinet minister has had a lifetime of overcoming" <u>Era-Banner</u> June 19, 2006: 1.
- Uppal, Puja. "McGuinty hopes to improve ties to India: 21st Century strategy" <u>National</u> Post February 14, 2007: A15.
- Walker, William. "Minister 'tripped up,' Premier says Tuna remark due to 'inexperience" <u>The Toronto Star</u> October 5, 1995: A26.
- White, Graham. ed. <u>The Government and Politics of Ontario</u> Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997.