PROVINCIAL UNITY AMIDST A DIMINISHING PRESS GALLERY

by

LESLIE DE MEULLES

2009-2010 INTERN

THE ONTARIO LEGISLATURE INTERNSHIP PROGRAMME (OLIP)

1303A WHITNEY BLOCK
QUEEN'S PARK
TORONTO, ONTARIO
M7A 1A1

EMAIL: leslie.demeulles@gmail.com

A free and independent press has become one of the hallmarks of a healthy democracy. Press galleries and bureaus have similarly become a cornerstone of the democratic process insofar as they independently report on, and keep politicians accountable. However, the Ontario Legislature Press Gallery membership has been declining over the past 20 years. This decline may very well be an indicator that this ‘valued’ democratic institution is in dire straits. This paper attempts to explain why the Press Gallery is shrinking and how decreasing number have led to a lack of political coverage to Northern Ontario, and is leading Northern constituents to rely heavily on their MPPs as a source of political news. This is problematic, as MPP communication can hardly be expected to be non-partisan, objective reporting on the events at Queen’s Park. That people in Northern Ontario rely on partisan political messaging as a substitute for political news shows how the media as an institution is failing the North, as relying on these forms of communication is akin to relying on propaganda.

Due to a dearth of literature on the Ontario Legislature, the research for this paper relied on interviews conducted with Northern MPPs, and current and former Press Gallery members. The paper exists in three parts. The first gives a brief history of journalism and how its perception has changed, both by the public and journalists. We will see that, although journalists professionally see themselves, for the most part, as ‘watchdogs’, a shrinking Press Gallery limits journalists in their ability to play this role, especially to the people of Northern Ontario. The second focuses on what many, if not all journalists interviewed for this paper indicated were the major external factors affecting their profession and contribute to their inability to cover the North: new technology, the economy and media ownership consolidation. The third focuses on how the people of Northern Ontario currently inform themselves about provincial politics given the lack of coverage from both local and Queen’s Park reporter. Northerners are informing themselves with partisan messaging, such as press releases, rather than relying on independent media. This is detrimental to a healthy democracy in Ontario.

How we define the role of journalists, and how journalists see themselves indicates our expectations of professional journalism in society and to our democracy. Public expectations of journalists have evolved. Pre-Confederate journalists were ideologically opposed. Some were considered purely partisan mouthpieces of those in power and the official record was reported only by newspapers “sympathetic to their politics”, while others were political radicals. Opposing papers wrote as fearless defenders of their political ideology—even to the point of death. John Beverly Robinson, attorney general during the 1837 Rebellion in Upper Canada said the following before hanging two such rebels, Samuel Lount and Peter Matthew:

\[
\text{It is one of the miserable consequences of the abuse of liberty that a licentious press is permitted to poison the public mind with the most absurd and wicked misrepresentations, which the ill-disposed, without inquiry, receive and act upon as truths.}
\]

It is useful, for the purposes of this paper, to examine briefly how we have arrived at our current understanding of what the media and journalists are, and what their role is in our democratic society. Since pre-Confederate times, the concept of an independent media has developed. It originally began with the introduction of the Hansard, a verbatim record of political proceedings.

1 Appendix G lists a complete list of all interviews conducted, though not all interviews are cited in this paper.
4 Nesbitt-Larking, p. 38.
Hansard was first introduced as the official record of the House of Commons proceedings in 1880. Although Ottawa had Hansard very early on, Hansard-style reporting “did not begin in Ontario until 1944”\(^5\). The introduction of Hansard inside the Legislature indicated a shift toward more objective reporting. This trend was also occurring outside the Legislature. By the turn of the 20\(^{\text{th}}\) century, in Canada there were 9 self-declared independent papers, while the other 45 were still at least partially politically affiliated\(^6\). By the 1930s, these numbers had reversed.

Since the 1930s, there has been an even further professionalization of a non-partisan, independent media. Today there are institutional structures that are meant to speak on behalf of journalists as a profession, as well as keep our journalists accountable. The Canadian Association of Journalists, MediaWatch, the Ontario Press Council and ombudspersons are examples of institutional structures that regulate and monitor journalism today. While John Beverly Robinson criticized journalists for their ‘poisonous’ influence, journalists today are admired for their analysis, admonition and scrutiny of the government—in fact, it’s considered their professional duty. Current definitions what journalists are from communications scholars reflect our modern expectations of the press. Among the most significant definitions, Fred Fletcher proposes that journalists are “crucial interpreters of political events, signaling what is important and placing events in context” and that the Ontario Legislature Press Gallery is “an essential part of the system that holds the government accountable for its actions”\(^7\). Other communications academics, such as Nick Russell and Marc Raboy, speak similarly about the free press as “crucial to democracy”\(^8\) and necessary “to structure and sustain public debate”\(^9\). From interviews conducted with current members of the Press Gallery, it seems that these definitions match how journalists define themselves and their role in our democratic system. Tanya Talaga of the Toronto Star defined her role as journalists at Queen’s Park this way: “We’re the public watchdog…We’re storytellers”\(^10\); Robert Benzie of the Toronto Star believes that credibility and objectivity are the greatest strengths of journalism: “My view is that a newspaper is credible because anyone can pick up a newspaper and say ‘this information isn’t tainted’…We’re a watchdog”\(^11\). Christina Blizzard, columnist for the Toronto Sun, gave this response:

I think the role of the political journalist is to be a presence here at Queen’s Park, to ask questions my readers would ask if they could be here…to hold the politicians to account, in a way that my readers, who are busy doing other things, who would like to ask questions, but can’t.\(^12\)

All three definitions emphasize holding the government to account; other interviewees responded with the same sentiment—reporting on “what mattered”\(^13\) to people, what they would want to

---

\(^6\) Nesbitt-Larking p. 40.
\(^12\) Blizzard, Christina, journalist Toronto Sun. Personal Interview. 22 January, 2010.
“know and understand”14 because it affected them. The interviewees’ comments point out exactly where the Press Gallery is lacking for the people of Northern Ontario. There are no journalists from Northern papers in the Press Gallery, no one who would be able to ask questions on behalf of people from the North or from a Northern perspective. In that respect, no reporter is at Queen’s Park asking the questions that a Northern Ontario resident would ask—no journalist can ask those questions from a Northern perspective.

Aside from the internal evolution of journalism from partisan to professional, external factors have also shaped what journalism is today and ultimately journalists’ ability to cover Northern issues, namely: technology, the economy and consolidation of media ownership. Generally speaking, the introduction of television and radio journalism increased the number at the Press Gallery and saw greater and more diverse coverage of the Legislature. There is no comprehensive list of Press Gallery members of the Ontario Legislature. To examine how the membership has changed over the years, a list was compiled from 1950-2010 by photocopying the Legislature phone books, which are stored in the Legislature Library. Recent lists (from 2007-2010) were still in possession of the Press Gallery coordinator15. A graph found in Appendix A shows the trends in the Press Gallery membership. There are three notable trends in the graph worth explaining here. The first is a sharp spike in 2006 numbers of part-time members. The graph indicates that there no part-time members between approximately 1996-2006; this cannot be fully explained. It is probable that these numbers coincide with media consolidation, and a rapid decrease in all press bureaus. The subsequent increase as of 2006 may be explained by further cutbacks to bureaus; media conglomerates unwilling to staff a full-time bureau begin replacing them with part-time members. The other two notable features in the graph occur in the mid 1960s and in the late 1990s. The spike in full-time members in the late 60s coincides with the introduction of new technologies (radio, television). The second spike, and subsequent decline in membership, coincides with media consolidation and buy out of the local papers. The declining numbers also coincide with the economic recession and cutbacks in staff and resources in general.

As we can see from the graph, new technology affected the Press Gallery membership. In 1950, there were four members of the Gallery, all print journalists. As of 1962, there were 10 print journalists, as well as two radio and television reporters, from CKEY and CBC-TV, respectively16. The introduction of new media meant that the Press Gallery grew quite significantly17. Though there was initial backlash from print journalists with the introduction of both television and radio, print journalists believing their medium to be the most effective way to communicate political issues, these ‘new media’ were gradually accepted. The mid 1980s saw hey-day in the Gallery with 40 full-time members and 23 part-time members. Numbers kept grow in the Gallery up until about the mid 1990s; there were 58 full-time members in 1998. By the turn of the 21st century, we start to see significant decreases in membership. Only two years after membership was at one of its highest points, membership had almost halved, showing full-time membership down to 36 members. Today, there are approximately 25 members who pay membership to have a bureau at Queen’s Park. The membership for 2010’s Press Gallery is

15 Special thanks to Gerald Christopher, Press Gallery Coordinator, who assisted in the compilation of this list.
16 CKEY radio was a Toronto radio station evolved from an AM radio station on 580/590 to CHUM radio, to CFRB radio. More historical information about CKEY can be found at http://www.ckeyradio.com/watn.html.
17 Data obtained for this graph is original data compiled by the author. The complete list is not listed as an Appendix, as the data file is too large to include in this paper.
approximate; some members who are listed as full-time are actually rarely seen at Queen’s Park. Steve Paikin, for example, who is listed as a member of the Press Gallery is seldom seen in the Gallery observing Question Period, and only is in attendance for such high-profile events such as the Throne Speech. Such sporadic attendance can hardly be considered as true membership in the Gallery, or a sincere attempt at covering Queen’s Park. While Steve Paikin was used as an example, this fact is true of a number of other journalists who are currently listed as members on the 2010 membership list.

Some technological changes have affected the increase in membership: but what can account for the decrease? One reason may be that there is less demand for political news in all forms of media. Sean Mallen noted that he has to “fight to get it[political coverage] on the air”\textsuperscript{18}, as many editors believe the average viewer/reader to be disaffected with politics. Tevised proceedings of the Legislature partly explains the average person’s cynicism with politics. As a result of the fifth report of the Camp Commission, a commission designed to review the overwhelming power of the executive over the Legislature, on October 4\textsuperscript{th} 1986, Ontario installed televisions into the Legislature\textsuperscript{19}. Ontario was the fourth legislature to incorporate television into the proceedings which gave live coverage of question period, debates as well as committee meetings. The introduction of broadcast media intensified partisanship between members, as well as the theatrical aspect of the legislative proceedings—especially question period. As Jim Coyle observed, “Politicians themselves began playing to the cameras with every kind of stunt and rhetoric and insult and cheesy opportunism… now politicians and journalists are the bottom of the credibility list for most surveys put out.”\textsuperscript{20} While politicians pull stunts and theatrics in the House, journalists cover it, as they have little other choice. Sean Mallen commented on the fact that political news tends to be the type of coverage that encourages the viewers’ cynicism; not only do political issues “get less coverage…the coverage they do get tends to feed into that.”\textsuperscript{21} We can see that there is a vicious cycle—people are disaffected because of their negative perception of politicians, but the current coverage does nothing to dissolve those perceptions.

The Internet has sped up the news cycle to the extent that it has drastically changed the focus of journalism. As Jim Coyle put it, “speed is of the essence now.”\textsuperscript{22} Both print and broadcast journalists interviewed remarked on the fast turnaround time to file their stories which gives them less time to go in-depth on their stories, to do investigative journalism, or even to follow up on a story they had started earlier that day\textsuperscript{23}. There is also the expectation that all stories must be filed immediately to the Internet. That journalists will file a story from a BlackBerry immediately after witnessing an event, is common practice now.\textsuperscript{24} Those with Internet access at home, especially high-speed Internet, and those with Blackberries, iphones or Google phones, have the expectation to “download music, games, photos, articles from

\textsuperscript{18} Mallen interview.
\textsuperscript{21} Mallen, Interview.
\textsuperscript{22} Coyle, interview.
\textsuperscript{24} Benzie Interview.
newspaper web sites, archives, films, and TV programs. Traditional forms of media, newspaper, TV, radio, must now compete to keep their listeners, viewers and readers who expect to get their news exclusively from the Internet; why would they risk covering stories that the majority of their readership just doesn’t care about? As Randy Rath put it “people[in Southern Ontario] just don’t care about what’s happening in the North. They just don’t”.

As per Rath’s comments, it seems unlikely that journalists from the Greater Toronto Area (GTA), who are already so pressed for time to file their stories, would have the time to consider how the issues affect residents of Northern Ontario. The effect on local print or broadcast media outlets in Northern or rural areas without a Queen’s Park correspondent is that they will turn to press releases from the MPP from their constituency to file online, just to keep up with the accelerating news cycle.

The Press Gallery is also shrinking because of media consolidation. Marc Raboy criticizes Canada for its unprecedented media consolidation, as “[n]o other Western country accepts the same degree of conglomeration in media.” As per figures from 2007, CanWest Global’s newspapers account for 30 per cent of Canada’s daily circulation, while Québecor controls about 20 per cent. What has caused the conglomerates to maintain power and consolidate ownership? According to Marc Raboy and David Taras, the government and the CRTC allowed for the creation of our gargantuan media conglomerates and for their monopoly so these companies can remain competitive in the global market. The conglomerates’ “properties include newspapers, radio and TV stations, satellite services, magazines, cable operations, and sports franchises” which, as we can see, spans across all forms of media and entertainment.

Media ownership as it stands today is mainly comprised of Bell Global Media (BGM), Torstar, CanWest Global, Québecor and Rogers Communication. Within BGM there is CTV, the Globe and Mail and many cable channels. Torstar, which owns 20% of BGM, and also controls BGM with Woodbridge, runs the Toronto Star, the Hamilton Spectator, many newspaper properties in Southern Ontario, 50% of Sing Tao, the biggest Chinese language newspaper in Canada and Harlequin books. CanWest owns Global TV and the Southam newspapers including the National Post and many regional newspapers. Québecor has a monopoly on media in Québec, which also affects Ontario media. Québecor owns Sun Media, which, in turn, controls all tabloid papers in Toronto and Ottawa and a number of local papers in the North, such as the North Bay Nugget. Clearly these five conglomerates dominate the majority of the media in Canada. Many academics, most notably Harold Innis have commented on the negative effect of ownership and

---

26 Rath, Randy, journalist CHCH TV. Personal Interview. 22 January, 2010.
27 See Appendix F for an example of a press release being used by a news website. The website, OntarioNewsNorth, is registered with the Ontario Press Council (OPC), though clearly does not meet many of the journalistic standards set by the OPC.
29 Nesbitt-Larking pp. 43-45.
30 Raboy and Taras, p. 87.
how consolidated corporate ownership generates more concern about the bottom line, rather than quality news coverage\textsuperscript{33}.

Consolidated ownership has directly affected our Press Gallery. For example, the \textit{Sudbury Star} once had a bureau at Queen’s Park (the last recorded bureau held by the \textit{Sudbury Star} was in from 1966-1969). The \textit{Star} was owned by the Thompson chain of newspapers but has since been bought out first by Osprey Media, which was then bought out by Québecor, which encompasses the Sun chain newspapers. Not only does the \textit{Sudbury Star}, a paper that services a 250-mile radius, not have a bureau anymore, neither does Thompson. There is only one writer representing Québecor at Queen’s Park, and she writes for the \textit{Toronto Sun}. Although the current list of Press Gallery members would lead us to believe that there are more members from the \textit{Toronto Sun} at Queen’s Park, Christina Blizzard is the only \textit{Sun} member who somewhat consistently will publish in Northern newspapers. Intuitively, we might think that local papers would be better protected under a huge conglomerate, as they have a larger and more stable revenue base to protect their subsidiaries. The reality is local papers are worse off than if they were on their own. Scarce resources and economic downturn have led to cutbacks. When those tough budget decisions need to be made, it makes practical sense that the resources and staff are put into those papers with the greatest distribution and readership. The greatest population concentration remains in urban Southern Ontario, specifically the Greater Toronto Area (GTA); it makes business sense to tailor news coverage to the areas with the greatest readership, and Northern Ontario’s population is small compared to that of the rest of the province\textsuperscript{34}. By virtue of the fact that less people live in rural and Northern areas, they are more likely to see greater cuts to their resources and staff, than would the \textit{Toronto Star}, the largest circulation newspaper in Canada, or the \textit{Globe and Mail}, a paper with great reputation and readership\textsuperscript{35}.

From a business standpoint, these cuts make sense. Even though we consider journalism a public good, at the end of the day, the media industry is just that—an industry. As an industry, journalism and print journalism in particular is losing its economic viability. Up until now, “newspapers have been able to produce this particular public good—newsworthy information, necessary to hold government accountable—on a commercial basis”\textsuperscript{36}. Advertisers no longer have to rely on newspapers to publish their ads. A number of cheaper alternative to posting want ads, for example, have been undercut by such free websites such as Kijiji and Craigslist\textsuperscript{37}.

The same problem exists for television stations. As Paul Bliss puts it, “if you wanted to advertise in London, you had to go to the local TV station, but now there are a 100 different vehicles that allow you to advertise”\textsuperscript{38}. With many different advertising methods at their disposal, advertisers no longer have to rely on traditional media to run their ads. Both Sean Mallen of \textit{Focus Ontario} and Jim Coyle of the \textit{Toronto Star} mused on how the economy has affected their capacity to cover their stories. In attempts to retain viewers, editors of broadcast and print journalism have become increasingly unwilling to include political coverage. Larger media

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{33} Nesbitt-Larking, 116.
\bibitem{34} Hall, Heather and Betsy Donald. “Innovation and Creativity on the Periphery: Challenges and Opportunities in Northern Ontario” February 2009 Working Paper Series: Ontario in the Creative Age: 1-33.
\bibitem{35} It is acknowledged that the deleterious effects of a shrinking Press Gallery affect rural Southern Ontario and Northern Ontario in similar ways. However, analysis of the effects on the rural South is beyond the purview of this paper.
\bibitem{37} Starr \textit{The New Republic} p. 33.
\bibitem{38} Bliss Interview.
\end{thebibliography}
outlets staff their Queen’s Park bureau with one member doing double-duty. For example, CBC TV relies on their one radio staff to inform them if there is a story “worth covering.” The same applies to Radio-Canada—Christian Noel staffs both the TV and radio components of French language coverage for the CBC. Jim Coyle noted that the economic downturn has caused a decrease in column length from 900 to 600 words. He believes this “makes it harder to write about the complex legislative issues and lends itself more to the human interest stuff.” But journalists are not the only ones who have observed the effect of hard times on their industry—MPPs have noticed it too.

A 2008 article in the Toronto Star highlighted Liberal MPP Bob Delaney’s outcry against StarChoice (a satellite company) and their decision to drop the Ontario Legislature channel. According to the article, StarChoice believed the legislative proceedings were occupying precious advertising space and decided to sell the bandwidth commercially. While the Legislature proceedings are available online, “it[the channel] is not accessible to many seniors and those in rural areas without high-speed Internet.” In this instance, the bottom line overpowered the public good. Recently appointed Senator, and former PC MPP Bob Runciman also commented on this issue in 2008. Runciman was disturbed by the shrinking Press Gallery, and annoyed particularly by the fact that TVO was no longer staffing a bureau at the Legislature, mostly because TVO receives funding from the Ontario government. Runciman’s worry was that, with a smaller Press Gallery, the media was unable to fulfill its mandate as a public good, and that “provincial affairs [weren’t] getting enough public scrutiny.” Tanya Talaga of the Toronto Star affirms the effect of a bad economy and media consolidation on journalism in general and relates this larger problem particularly to the Queen’s Park Press Gallery: “The media convergence has caused a shrinking gallery, which is to the detriment of the quality of the stories that get out and especially is to the detriment of the papers up North that might rely on one source.”

It is worth re-iterating a few key points regarding the changes in technology, media consolidation and economy that have been illustrated thus far. First, news consumers have more choice, and also undirected choice that negatively affects their political knowledge. Second, media consolidation has led to a lesser focus on local newspapers or TV stations, and also stories about smaller Northern communities, in the interest of maximizing limited resources. Third, and related to the second, with a weakened economy, staff and resources cutbacks are even more brutal because of the need to be frugal in tough economic times. This is resulting in less coverage to less populated areas, typically rural and northern areas. Negligent coverage of the North demonstrates a regional divide in our province. In 1994, G.R. Weller wrote about the disconnect between Northern and Southern Ontario, stating that there is a “[d]eep sense of grievance and alienation…which is partly a reflection of a perceived ignorance of the north on the part of those in Queen’s Park or the south in general.” A recent study reveals that this regional divide still exists. The study focused on showcasing economic strengths of the North, for example in “expertise in high-tech mining, eco-friendly forestry, remote health care and…cultural

39 Mallen interview.
40 Coyle interview.
42 Ferguson, Rob. “MPP Wants Legislature debates to air live on Web” Toronto Star, 21 April, 2008.
43 Talaga interview.
production of the North” and relied on interviews from ‘key informants’, or local entrepreneurs or people involved in Northern economic development.

Heather Hall’s paper shows that not much has changed since Weller identified the problem of regionalism in ‘94. Some of the most telling quotations from Hall’s informants were: Our founders were discussing equity financing with an institution in Toronto and that institution was interested in the corporate story until they realized the company was based in Thunder Bay. The comment from the institution’s representative was ‘I thought you said North Bay’...implying that they don’t finance anything further north than North Bay.

Two other interesting quotations: “I think that Queen’s Park is a bit out of touch with the North. I don’t think they spend much time thinking about the North.”. Perhaps the most shocking: “as residents of the North, people sort of forget you exist.”. Hall’s interviews were conducted in February 2009. It is safe to assume that attitudes since then have not changed dramatically.

Randy Rath, current president of the Press Gallery, demonstrated that this attitude definitely exists in the South: “The [newspaper]owners perceive that the people who buy the papers and watch the shows don’t care about the North. You’ve got to somehow make news relevant to people in the South.”. While Rath’s comments ring true from a business perspective, his attitude serves to perpetuate the regional divide between Northern and Southern Ontario. If attitude continues to exist, it seems likely that coverage will continue to reflect this attitude.

Northern MPPs have also observed this regional divide; it is clear that they too feel ignored by Toronto-centered media. MPP France Gélinas “it is like pulling teeth to get attention from the media…”.

A media search of articles on the current strike confirmed both these opinions. A search conducted from August 1, 2009 (around the start of the strike) to May 1, 2010, showed that the Sudbury Star wrote 45 stories, mostly all in the A section, with the exception of one or two editorials. From a search conducted in the Globe and Mail, the National Post and the Toronto Star, only two articles appeared in the Globe, three in the Post (in the business section). Shockingly, the Toronto Star, a paper with a mandate to cover Toronto issues, gave the issue the most coverage; it featured six articles and also several others where the strike was not the headline story, but was mentioned in passing.
While perhaps it should not be expected that a local issue be covered in Southern newspapers, this strike ultimately affects the economy of the province as well and is of a great enough magnitude that it could understandably be of interest to some people in the South. This is but one recent example of how a regional divide affects coverage of the North. The Hon. Monique Smith, MPP for Nipissing and current Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs and House Leader, gave a more historical perspective on the issue: “In my seven years here we’ve had about three articles that look at North Bay or North Bay issues...For the most part, it’s a pretty Toronto-focused media”\(^{54}\). The Hon. Michael Gravelle, the Minister for Northern Development and Mines, as well as PC member Norm Miller, concurred with Minister Smith. This is a non-partisan issue that crosses all party lines. Clearly, the perception and the reality is that the North is largely ignored by the Press Gallery, with the exception of a particular interest story, or a catastrophic event. Even when the event is catastrophic, as some might argue about the Vale Inco strike, there is still little to no coverage. To be fair to the members of the Press Gallery, for the most part, it was not for lack of interest that led them to overlook the Northern perspective. Due to the constraints on their profession, as discussed earlier, current members simply don’t have the time, the resources or the mandate to cover a Northern perspective. Christina Blizzard of the \textit{Toronto Sun} writes columns two or three times a week, some of which occasionally appear in some Northern papers. Blizzard commented:

\begin{quote}
I love Northern Ontario, it’s a fascinating place. I think the cities there have huge different issues, and I think it’s actually really important for readers in Southern Ontario to understand the perspective of people in Thunder Bay, Sudbury, the Soo\{Sault St. Marie\} and places like that. I try very hard—it’s not easy, because it involves a lot of traveling and driving and effort, but I really believe that those places are very important and I do my best to try and visit them\(^{55}\).
\end{quote}

Despite Ms. Blizzard’s best efforts, as one journalist, she cannot possibly cover all the stories relevant to the North in her weekly columns. In addition, even if she did focus on one Northern community in one column, there would still be so many left uncovered. Another downside, despite Ms. Blizzard’s noble intentions, is that she is still a resident of Toronto reporting on Northern issues through Toronto-coloured glasses\(^{56}\). Jim Coyle of the \textit{Toronto Star}, also expressed his admiration for the North: “They[Northerners] come with a different experience and a different mindset; they’ve been some of my favourite people over the years”\(^{57}\). Robert Benzie, bureau chief of the \textit{Toronto Star}, also identified the lack of Northern coverage, and blamed it on the fact that Northern Ontario is not a politically important region. As he said, “You can win government without having a single seat in the North”\(^{58}\). Mostly all Press Gallery members interviewed listed lack of resources, as well as having a strict Southern Ontario mandate as the main reason why there is so little coverage of the North.

\begin{flushleft}
\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item While Ms. Blizzard’s best efforts, as one journalist, she cannot possibly cover all the stories relevant to the North in her weekly columns. In addition, even if she did focus on one Northern community in one column, there would still be so many left uncovered. Another downside, despite Ms. Blizzard’s noble intentions, is that she is still a resident of Toronto reporting on Northern issues through Toronto-coloured glasses. Jim Coyle of the \textit{Toronto Star}, also expressed his admiration for the North: “They[Northerners] come with a different experience and a different mindset; they’ve been some of my favourite people over the years. Robert Benzie, bureau chief of the \textit{Toronto Star}, also identified the lack of Northern coverage, and blamed it on the fact that Northern Ontario is not a politically important region. As he said, “You can win government without having a single seat in the North”. Mostly all Press Gallery members interviewed listed lack of resources, as well as having a strict Southern Ontario mandate as the main reason why there is so little coverage of the North.
\end{itemize}
\end{flushleft}
From the local perspective, we see the same problem, vice-versa. As MPP Norm Miller put it “The local papers don’t have any coverage[of Queen’s Park] at all unless it’s in reaction to something that I’ve sent out….Other than me stimulating something, there’s no coverage.” The sad truth is that local papers don’t have the space to devote to provincial coverage, while the Toronto-based papers don’t have the space to cover the North. CBC Radio journalist Marcus Schwabe, who hosts the morning show on CBC Radio Sudbury, explained that he just doesn’t have the mandate to cover Queen’s Park, and leaves it to the Queen’s Park correspondent. Aside from the odd interview with a Northern MPP, Schwabe said, he really only covers the local stories. And so we find ourselves in an unfortunate catch-22: Queen’s Park journalists can’t cover the North and the North can’t cover Queen’s Park. So how does the typical Northern Ontarian get politically informed?

First we must look at what types of media Northerners most typically engage with on a daily or regular basis. Based on MPP interview, constituents will use consult print, radio, television, though less frequently the Internet to learn about political issues. Most MPPs responded that radio was the best way for their constituents to be informed. MPP France Gélinas explained that her constituents, especially the French-speaking constituents, rely on Radio-Canada, or the CBC’s French radio broadcast: “On the French side, the coverage[of Queen’s Park] is pretty good because there is only the CBC”. Minister Gravelle also agreed that “There’s no question that the CBC plays a big role” in informing his constituents. In terms of television, MPP Norm Miller noted that, although many people watch television, or will watch the CBC or CTV news, it is not the best source of information because those stations “aren’t covering Queen’s Park to a great extent”. We have already identified how print journalism lacks in terms of Queen’s Park coverage, both from the local and Toronto side. In other words, the main newspapers, Globe and Mail, Toronto Star, Toronto Sun and the National Post hardly have the resources or the mandate to cover Queen’s Park anymore.

Even if Northerners were reading these papers for what limited Queen’s Park coverage existed, all northern MPPs confirmed that their constituents rely mainly on their daily local newspaper as a news source anyway, even though papers such as the Globe and Mail or the Toronto Star may be available for distribution in their area. As MPP France Gélinas remarked: “Are there people in Sudbury that buy the Toronto Star or the Globe and Mail? Probably, but you can count them in the dozens. Everybody reads the Northern Life”. Minister Gravelle also commented that his constituents were far more likely to read their local newspaper, the Thunder Bay Chronicle, as “The Globe and Mail is flown in; the Toronto Star doesn’t arrive until a day later. (T)he local paper is of greater importance to everybody”. Minister Gravelle was the only MPP to note that he felt his constituents were using his website with a greater frequency, though he did mention that his current Ministerial portfolio may explain the increase in web attention.

60 A discussion of the difference between French and English coverage, and the linguistic divide that exists in Ontario for political coverage is also an interesting topic and intersects with issues of regionalism. However, that topic, unfortunately, is beyond the scope of this paper.
61 Smith Monique, Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs. Personal Interview. 4 March, 2010. Minister Smith also commented: “I think through CBC Radio and Radio Canada they get some information”; MPP Norm Miller concurred: “The main coverage of Queen’s Park is CBC Radio…probably the most consistent coverage and it’s accessible for people”.
62 Miller interview.
63 Gélinas interview. The Northern Life is a Sudbury-run newspaper owned by the Laurentian Media Group.
64 Gravelle, Michael, Minister of Northern Development and Mines. Personal Interview. 15 April, 2010.
From interviews with Northern MPPs, it seems that Northerners still engage with the media through a variety of mediums, though the information they receive does not typically focus on provincial politics.

As a news source, the Internet is unreliable, unless users are specifically using it as a news source. Unless Internet users know what they are looking for, or where to find news, it is probable that they won’t find it by accident. While watching either cable or satellite television the viewer can always scan the preview channel to see ‘what’s on’. Also, a viewer channel surfing may haphazardly flip past the news, and stop briefly to listen to a story that interests them. There is no preview channel on the Internet. What viewers/readers choose is left up to the whim of our curiosity, imagination, the suggestion of a friend or colleague, the post on a Facebook wall. Those who seek their political news online need to know where to look in order to become informed, but those who are not politically inclined are far less likely to stumble upon any news in the same way as they would while watching television. MPP Norm Miller for Parry Sound-Muskoka confirms this argument. MPP Miller commented that “people aren’t motivated enough to seek out the coverage of Queen’s Park online, so it’s better for them if it’s just there on the television”\(^{65}\). Paul Starr believes choice hinders, rather than enables us as political actors and that “greater freedom of media choice le[ads] to a diminished audience for the news, less political knowledge and lower civic engagement”\(^{66}\). MPP France Gélinas for Nickel Belt riding confirms that greater choice led to a decrease in political knowledge: “we[Sudburyians] have many local radio stations and TV stations”. MPP Gélinas also said her constituents would be less likely to watch any political news, even if it was covered on Global or CTV. Apply this statement to the nature of the Internet: even if CBC.ca covers political issues, how likely is it that someone would stumble across this coverage, even if it was there?

With a lack of provincial political news available to Northern constituents, the question remains: how do Northerners inform themselves on provincial issues?

According to Minister Gravelle:, “Most of the news generated out of Queen’s Park is generated by the Members themselves such as myself who would send press releases to their local media and radio stations”\(^{67}\). This is worrisome indeed. It cannot be said that press releases are a credible news source. In fact, we should have no “illusions about the propagandist nature of [press] releases”\(^{68}\), as they are meant to inform the constituent, or media outlets about a particular issue that is consistent with the political messaging of the party. For example, it is rare to see a Government issued press release criticizing a Government policy (Appendix F is a perfect example of a seemingly harmless, though completely one-sided press release). It is also rare to see an Opposition press release in praise of any Government action. In short, press releases are partisan.

MPP France Gélinas identifies this very problem in the local media, using the Throne Speech as an example: “when [it] comes out, exactly verbatim what the government has released will be put in the regional papers. …what comes out of press releases that gets put into the local papers or read on the news bulletin. That is not journalism”\(^{69}\). MPP Norm Miller also pointed out that he was a sort of news liaison between Queen’s Park and the local media. With the exception

---

\(^{65}\) MPP Norm Miller. Personal interview. 22 April, 2010.


\(^{67}\) Gravelle interview.

\(^{68}\) Russell, p. 76.

\(^{69}\) Gélinas interview.
of large events, such as the release of the Budget or the Throne Speech, the local media does not cover Queen’s Park at all. As MPP Miller put it: “The local papers don’t have any coverage[of Queen’s Park] at all unless it’s in reaction to something[a press release] that I’ve sent out, or a press release that another MPP has sent out”\(^{70}\). From the journalist’s perspective a reliance on press releases, or government-issued media, contravenes the journalist’s code of honour to report objectively on an event or a story. CTV reporter Paul Bliss said that he has more reliance on Government or Queen’s Park released media being used by local journalists. He give the example of media from the Premier’s Office: “The Premier’s Office is live streaming a lot of news events and I’ve seen news stations use that footage for their coverage of an event… that’s dangerous. You cover your own stuff, you don’t rely on them[politicians] to give it you”\(^{71}\).

Clearly, Bliss believes that using government issued media is not journalism, if we consider journalism to be un-biased coverage from an authoritative source.

Aside from press releases, constituents are being informed by their MPPs through other media as well. All four MPPs confirmed that they are in close contact with all forms of local media, whether radio, television, op-eds in their local papers or through newsletters, commonly known as 'householders’. Minister Smith explained that she has “a slot on (her) local cable news show and we talk about provincial issues. So I have the ability to talk about those issues from a Northern perspective”\(^{72}\). Minister Gravelle and MPP Miller also stated that they appeared on their local cable stations on a regular basis. To clarify, that MPPs are communicating with their constituents via local media is not inherently bad. However, when this local coverage from MPPs is not mediated with the ‘other side’ of the story by unbiased media coverage, then this MPP communication becomes problematic. It seems natural that, when neither the local media nor the Press Gallery have the resources to offer consistent and frequent coverage of Northern issues or how these issues affect Northerners, constituents would turn to their provincial representatives for clarification. All MPP interviewees expressed a sincere and genuine interest in informing their constituents, and even in a non-partisan way. Minister Gravelle explained that Northerners in particular might be more comfortable approaching their MPP for information as he believed Northerners have a closer relationship with their MPPs. According to Minister Gravelle, in the GTA, where the population is greater and also more dense, people could easily become confused as to who their MPP is. Whereas in the North (and perhaps also in rural Southern Ontario), urban centres are clearly distinguished from one another and are also further apart from another. Because of these geographic differences, MPP Gravelle believes that northern constituents strongly identify with who their MPP or MP is, and that their representatives tend to be more easily identifiable to the constituents:

*There’s a long history of us tending to feel more detached from Queen’s Park... I think that Northern Ontario citizens have a much closer relationship with their Northern MPPs than members in Toronto and that’s not meant as a criticism of members from Toronto...In the Northern ridings, the MPPs and MPs for that matter, have a personal relationship with their constituents...they[constituents] will even call me at home.*\(^{73}\)

---

\(^{70}\) Miller interview

\(^{71}\) Bliss interview.

\(^{72}\) Smith interview.

\(^{73}\) Gravelle interview.
If we believe Minister Gravelle and that constituents are more willing to trust their MPPs, then the risk that constituents will blindly believe the partisan messaging that they hear becomes even higher. From the interviews conducted, it is clear that constituents are reading press releases, householders, hearing their MPP on the radio and seeing them on TV, and that this is their main source of information about Queen’s Park. If there is no local coverage, and no other reporting, there is no unbiased reporting to counter the strict political messaging constituents encounter through their MPPs.

The lack of journalistic communication that is distinct from MPPs’ communications is problematic and worrisome. The lack of third-part analysis on the part of journalists as to how policies may affect a community is more serious than we might think. When there is no balanced account of a political situation, or only one-sided reporting of a new policy, our credible news source becomes anemic. MPP-constituent communication is important, and of course we expect that the MPP will give updates on their Queen’s Park activities, and what they are doing in the community. Some MPPs do not want their householders to be partisan; MPP Norm Miller and Minister Smith both stated this explicitly when asked. Regardless of the best efforts or noble intentions of Northern MPPs, their story is one-sided. Constituents’ reliance either entirely or mostly on the communication from their MPP for their political information and allowing our political information entrenched in party ideology or partisan intent is risky. The risk is that constituents will believe the content of the press release to be the whole story, rather than one side of the story.

While press releases and most other forms of party communication “may communicate the kernel of a news story”74, it isn’t the whole truth. It’s a partisan truth. In the strictest sense of the word, party messaging is propaganda—a form of communication meant to promote a very narrow set of views or ideas, by using a selection of facts or ideas. Northern constituents are relying on MPPs and party tools of communication as sources of unbiased information, a source that journalists are supposed to provide. As we saw in earlier parts of this paper, journalists define themselves as watchdogs over the political system by writing or broadcasting their news stores. But when most political news comes to Northern constituents from MPPs, who is the watchdog for the people of Northern Ontario? When we lose good journalism, and in the case of the North, when we have lost Queen’s Park reporting from Northern reporters on issues that matter to the North, we lose a public good and a democratic institution of the greatest importance. Journalists inform, question, analyze and hold politicians to account. Without those questions and analysis, people are left with questionable and unaccountable media sources, such as political blogs, citizen journalists and the strictly partisan forms of communication to inform them about the system that is supposed to represent them.

---

74 Russell, p. 76.
Works Cited


Gélinas, France, MPP. Personal Interview. 6 April, 2010.

Gravelle, Michael, Minister of Northern Development and Mines. Personal Interview. 15 April, 2010.


Miller, Norm, MPP. Personal Interview. 22 April, 2010.


Rath, Randy, journalist CHCH TV. Personal Interview. 22 January, 2010.


Schwabe, Marcus, journalist CBC Radio, Sudbury. Personal Interview. 2 February 2010.

Smith Monique, Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs. Personal Interview. 4 March, 2010.


Appendix A

Ontario Legislature Press Gallery Membership
1950-2010

Number of Members

Year

Full Time Members
Part Time Members
Québecor ownership:

Archambault: largest chain of music stores in Eastern Canada
Videotron: largest cable provider in Québec and third largest in Canada
SunMedia: largest chain of national tabloids and community newspapers in Canada
Group Livre: largest group of French-publishing houses in Canada
TVA: largest French-language broadcaster in North America
canoe.ca: Internet site
Le SuperClub Videotron Ltee: largest chain of video rentals in Québec
Nurun: international interactive consulting agency
Media Pages: print and online directory

SunMedia:

Daily newspapers:

Barrie Examiner
Belleville Intelligencer
Brantford Expositor
Chatham Daily News
Cobourg Daily Star
Cornwall Standard-Freeholder
Kingston Whig-Standard
Niagara Falls Review
North Bay Nugget
Orillia Packet & Times
Owen Sound Sun Times
Pembroke Daily Observer
Peterborough Examiner
Port Hope Evening Guide
Sarnia Observer
Sault Star
St Catharines Standard
Sudbury Star
Timmins Daily Press
Welland Tribune

Other newspapers:

Bancroft This Week
Barry's Bay This Week
Colborne Chronicle
Collingwood Enterprise-Bulletin
Community Press - Eastern Edition
Community Press - Quinte Edition
Community Press - Western Edition
Dresden Leader
Dunnville Chronicle
Elliot Lake Standard
Espanola Mid-North Monitor
Fort Erie Times
Gananoque Reporter
Haliburton County Echo
Innisfil Examiner
InPort News
Kingston This Week
Kirkland Lake Northern News
Lindsay Post
Markdale Standard
Midland Free Press
Minden Times
Napanee Guide
Niagara Advance
Niagara News - Thorold Edition
Pelham News
Pembroke / Petawawa News
Petrolia Topic
Picton County Weekly News
Sault Ste. Marie This Week
The Post
Trenton Trentonian
Wallaceburg News
West Niagara News

Sun Media Corporation's publications:

Le Journal de Montréal
Le Journal de Québec
The Ottawa Sun
The Toronto Sun
The London Free Press
The Winnipeg Sun
The Edmonton Sun
The Calgary Sun

Community dailies in Ontario:

The Recorder and Times - Brockville, Ontario
Stratford Beacon Herald - Ontario
St. Thomas Times-Journal - Ontario
The Daily Miner and News - Kenora, Ontario
Simcoe Reformer - Ontario
Woodstock Sentinel Review - Ontario
Appendix C

CanWest Global:

Broadcasting:

Global
HGTV
History TV
TVTropolis
Food Network
ShowCase
Slice
ShowCase DIVA
Action
National Geographic Channel
Mystery TV
Movie Time
IFC
BBC Canada
Deja View
Discovery Health
diy Network
Fox Sports World
BBC Kida

Print/Online:

National Post
Calgary Herald
Edmonton Journal
The Gazette (Montreal)
Ottawa Citizen
Leader-Post
The Star Phoenix (Saskatoon)
The Province (Vancouver)
The Vancouver Sun
Times Colonist (Victoria)
The Windsor Star
Canada.com
Driving.ca
Working.com
Househunting.ca
shopLocal
DOSE.ca
FPinfomart.ca
Appendix D

*Rogers Communication:*

**Radio (Ontario Only):**

600 CKAT (North Bay)
680 News (Toronto)
98.1 CHFI (Toronto)
AM 790 CIGM (Sudbury)
CHEZ 106 (Ottawa)
CHYM FM 96.7 (Kitchener)
EZ ROCK 100.5 (Sault Ste. Marie)
EZ ROCK 105.3 (Sudbury)
EZ ROCK 99.3 (Timmins)
EZ ROCK 100.5 (North Bay)
JACK FM 92.3 (Ottawa)
KISS 105.3 (Ottawa)
KISS 92.5 (Toronto)
570 AM Newstalk Radio (Kitchener)
Oldies 1310 (Ottawa)
Q104 FM (Sault Ste. Marie)
Q92 FM (Timmins)
Q 92.7 (Sudbury)
590 AM (Toronto)
101.9 THE FOX (North Bay)
Y101 FM (Ottawa)

**Magazine (Canada Wide):**

*Canadian Business*
*Châtelaine*
*FLARE*
*Hello*
*L’actualité*
*LOULOU*
*Maclean’s*
*Money Sense*
*Today’s Parent*

**Television (Ontario Only):**

CityTV
OMNI
The Biography Channel
Sportsnet
Rogers TV
OLN
G4Tech
The Shopping Channel

Sports:

Toronto Blue Jays
Sky Dome (aka, ROGERS Centre)
Appendix E

Bell Global Media/CTV Globe Media

Television

CTV:
CTV News Channel
BNN
CP 24
Atlantic Satellite Network (aka, A)
MuchMusic
MTV
Much LOUD
Much More Music
Much More Retro
Much Vibe
Much PUNCH
MTV 2
TSN
NHL Network
ESPN Classic
Fashion TV
Court TV
BRAVO!
Book TV
Discovery Channel
Discovery HD
Discovery Civilization Channel
Animal Planet
Travel + Escape
TV Land
The Comedy Network
Star!
Space
Access
CTV Olympics

Newspaper:

Globe and Mail

Radio:

CHUM FM (Toronto)
CHUM FM Operates 34 stations throughout Canada

**TORSTAR (owns a 20% equity interest in CTVglobemedia Inc.; owns 19.35% of Black Press):**

**Star Media Group:**

*The Toronto Star*
*Toronto.com*
*Metro*
*Sing Tao*
*Eye Weekly*
*eyeReturn Marketing*
*Canadian Immigrant*
*SUHAAG*
*Sway*

**Metroland Group Ltd.**

Daily Papers:

*Hamilton Spectator*
*Waterloo Region Record*
*Guelph Mercury*

Community Papers:

*Oshawa This Week*
*South Asian Focus*
*The Villager*
*The Brampton Guardian Weekend*
*Niagara This Week*
*The Liberal (Richmond Hill)*
*Peterborough This Week*

Websites:

www.Missisauga.com
www.Cambridgetimes.ca
www.Durhamregion.ca
www.goldbook.ca

Magazines:

*Canadian Autoworld*
Carguide
World of Wheels
Boats & RV's
Boatguide Canada
Boating Business
Ports Cruising Guides
Bridal
Beautiful Beginnings Bridal
Brampton Business Times
Durham Business Times
Durham Trade & Commerce
Faces of the Future
Mississauga Business Times
Northumberland Business Times
Toronto Business Times
Family & Parenting
City Parent
Durham Parent
What's UP
Health & Living
Beingwell Magazine
Home & Garden
Ideal Home
Kids & Youth
POP!
Toronto Kids
Whoa!
Lifestyle
Beyond the City
East of the City
Empty Nest
Forever Young News
Goodlife in the City
Grand
hmm... (Hamilton Mens Magazine)
Niagara Life
North of the City
Our Town Downtown
Sideroads of Caledon & Erin
Sideroads of Dufferin County
Sideroads of Halton Hills
Sideroads of Muskoka
Sideroads of Northumberland County
Sideroads of Parry Sound & Almaquin
Sideroads magazine focuses on the beauty of country living.
Sideroads of South Simcoe
Sideroads of Southern Georgian Bay
Sideroads magazine focuses on the beauty of country living.
The Kawarthan
West of the City
Formula Media Group
Hockey Now / NHL PowerPlay
Paton Publishing
Tee Time
Travel
Great City Getaways
Toronto Community News

Torstar Digital

Workopolis
Olive Media
Eyereturnmarketing.com

Harlequin

Reading for women, including romance novels, cookbooks, lifestyle/self-help books and fiction novels.
ONTARIO OFFICIAL SEAL

QUEEN’S PARK – Mike Brown, MPP, Algoma-Manitoulin, is pleased to announce that Northern Ontario residents will now have improved access to more post secondary education and training opportunities through enhanced distance learning services.

Ontario is supporting the upgrading and expansion of information technology to provide Contact North with the necessary equipment and bandwidth for its audio-conference, video-conference and e-learning technologies.

“This will help to ensure that all Ontario residents, including those in small and remote communities, can access high quality postsecondary education and training,” said Brown.

Contact North works in partnership with postsecondary institutions and community-based organizations to offer distance education to the more than 200,000 Northern residents who do not have direct access to postsecondary classrooms in their communities.

This investment is part of the McGuinty government’s five-year Open Ontario plan to create new opportunities for jobs and growth.

“Contact North provides a critical service for the residents of Northern Ontario. I am pleased that our government continues to recognize the significance of this organization’s work in providing innovative access to quality education and training,” said Michael Gravelle, Minister of Northern Development, Mines and Forestry.

“On the eve of its 25th anniversary as Northern Ontario’s Distance Education & Training Network, this investment by the Government of Ontario could not be more timely as Contact North experiences explosive growth of over 60 per cent in the number of course registrations facilitated during this past semester. This additional funding will allow Contact North to meet the growing education and training needs of residents of Northern Ontario communities and contribute to economic development across the North,” said Maxim Jean-Louis, President and CEO of Contact North.

QUICK FACTS

- The Ontario government has invested $3.5 million in 2009-10 in information technology enhancements and upgrades to the Contact North network.
- Contact North currently maintains access centres in over 90 small and remote communities across Northern Ontario, including more than 20 centres in First Nations communities.
- In 2009-10, 6,000 learners completed 17,600 full-and part-time courses using the Contact North network.
- The number of available courses recently increased by 30 per cent. In the fall 2009 semester, learners could choose from 322 college courses, 37 university courses, 93 literacy courses, and one secondary school course.

Source: [www.karinahunter.com](http://www.karinahunter.com); website titled: “Ontario News North”
Appendix G

Complete List of Interviewees


Fletcher, Dr. Fred, Professor Emeritus, Communication Studies and Political Science, University of British Columbia, University Professor, York University. Personal Interview 5 April, 2010.

Gélinas, France, MPP, Personal Interview. 6 April, 2010.

Gravelle, Michael, Minister of Northern Development and Mines. Personal Interview. 15 April, 2010.


Miller, Norm, MPP. Personal Interview. 22 April, 2010.

Rath, Randy, journalist CHCH TV. Personal Interview. 22 January, 2010.

Smith Monique, Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs. Personal Interview. 4 March, 2010.

Schwabe, Marcus, journalist CBC Radio, Sudbury. Personal Interview. 2 February 2010.


Waddell, Chris, Associate Professor, Director, Department of Journalism and Communication, Carleton University. Personal Interview 18 March, 2010.